

Interactive comment on “Fractal behavior of soil water storage at multiple depths” by Wenjun Ji et al.

J. M. Miras Avalos (Editor)

jose.manuel.miras.avalos@xunta.es

Received and published: 14 March 2016

The manuscript entitled “Fractal behavior of soil water storage at multiple depths” (Reference number NPG-2015-81) authored by W. Ji, M. Lin, A. Biswas, B.C. Si, H.W. Chau, and P. Cresswell presents results from a five-year study on the soil water storage from a transect in a hummocky landscape of central Canada. The authors applied multifractal and joint multifractal theories to this huge dataset in order to describe the fractal behavior of this variable at different depths along the transect.

I agree with the comments posted by reviewer1 and consider this manuscript very-well written and acceptable for publication after several modifications. Unfortunately, I have not received the comments from the second reviewer yet. Anyway, I carefully read the submitted manuscript and performed some comments and suggestions in order to

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



improve its quality.

The reported work is interesting and fits perfectly well within the scope of the Special Issue “Multifractal analysis in soil systems” to be published in Nonlinear Processes in Geophysics. However, the manuscript is rather long and information can be condensed as well as reduced since it seems repetitive in some portions. Tables can be improved and, from my point of view, figure 9 is not needed and can be deleted. Finally, a few English mistakes must be corrected.

In the attached file (supplement), I provide the authors with some suggestions in order to improve their manuscript. Therefore, the authors must address these issues prior to the acceptance of their manuscript. They must correct them in order that this manuscript achieves the standard quality for being published in Nonlinear Processes in Geophysics.

Therefore, I recommend a moderate revision prior to its publication in this journal.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.nonlin-processes-geophys-discuss.net/npg-2015-81/npg-2015-81-EC1-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Nonlin. Processes Geophys. Discuss., doi:10.5194/npg-2015-81, 2016.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

